IGNACIA S. MORENO

Assistant Attorney General Environment and Natural Resources Division United States Department of Justice

JOHN P. TUSTIN, Trial Attorney

**Natural Resources Section** 

P.O. Box 663

Washington, D.C. 20044-0663

Phone: (202) 305-3022/Fax: (202) 305-0506

john.tustin@usdoj.gov

ANDREW A. SMITH, Trial Attorney

Natural Resources Section c/o U.S. Attorney's Office

P.O. Box 607

Albuquerque, NM 87103

Phone: (505) 224-1468/Fax: (505) 346-7205

andrew.smith6@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Federal Defendants

## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW MEXICO

THE LOS ALAMOS STUDY GROUP,	)
,	) Case No. 1:10-CV-0760-JH-ACT
Plaintiff,	)
	) FEDERAL DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS
V.	) TO THE MAGISTRATE JUDGE'S
	) PROPOSED FINDINGS AND
UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF	) RECOMMENDED DISPOSITION
ENERGY, et al.	) [DKT. No. 25]
	)
Federal Defendants.	)
	)

On January 6, 2011, the Magistrate Judge recommended granting the Federal Defendants' Motion to Dismiss and dismissing Plaintiff's Complaint in its entirety based on the doctrine of prudential mootness. (Dkt. No. 25, ¶ 5). Federal Defendants note that the Magistrate Judge based his recommendation solely upon the doctrine of prudential mootness and did not address the other

Fed. Defs.' Obj. to Findings and Rec.

Case No. 1:10-CV-0760-JH-ACT

grounds for relief raised in Federal Defendants' motion to dismiss. Dkt. No. 25, ¶¶ 4, 5; see Dkt. No. 9, at 9-24 (asserting that some of Plaintiff's claims are time-barred; Plaintiff's claims are not ripe for review; and Plaintiff's claims are moot). The other grounds raised in Federal Defendant's motion to dismiss provide additional, alternative grounds for the Court to dismiss Plaintiff's Complaint.

Upon review of the Proposed Findings and Recommended Disposition, Federal Defendants observed two minor inaccuracies that warrant correction but do not affect the outcome of the findings or recommendation. First, the Magistrate Judge found that the Chemistry and Metallurgy Research ("CMR") Building was almost 60 years old in 2002. Dkt. No. 25, ¶ 6. The CMR Building was almost 60 years old in 2010, not 2002. See Declaration of Donald L. Cook (hereinafter, "Cook Decl."), Dkt. No. 9-1, ¶ 6. Second, the Magistrate Judge found that Plaintiff Los Alamos Study Group wrote to Federal Defendants Department of Energy and the National Nuclear Security Administration ("DOE/NNSA" or "NNSA") on July 1, 2010, to express concerns about the cost and adequacy of NNSA's analysis under the National Environmental Policy Act ("NEPA") of the CMR Building's proposed replacement, the Chemistry and Metallurgy Research Replacement Nuclear Facility ("CMRR-NF"). Dkt. No. 25, ¶ 11. Plaintiff's July 1, 2010 letter expressed concerns about the cost of the CMRR-NF and the adequacy of Federal Defendants' NEPA analysis, not the cost of the NEPA analysis. See Cook Decl., ¶ 15; see also Complaint ("Compl."), Dkt. No. 1, ¶¶ 15, 16; Affidavit of Gregory Mello, Dkt. No. 10-1, ¶ 26.

Federal Defendants wish to correct these two minor factual inaccuracies so that the District Court can be fully informed in its review of the Magistrate Judge's Proposed Findings and Recommended Disposition, which are well-reasoned and should be adopted.

Respectfully submitted on this 20th day of January, 2011.

IGNACIA S. MORENO **Assistant Attorney General** Environment and Natural Resources Division United States Department of Justice

/s/ John P. Tustin

john.tustin@usdoj.gov

JOHN P. TUSTIN, Trial Attorney Natural Resources Section P.O. Box 663 Washington, D.C. 20044-0663 Phone: (202) 305-3022/Fax: (202) 305-0506

ANDREW A. SMITH, Trial Attorney Natural Resources Section c/o U.S. Attorney's Office P.O. Box 607 Albuquerque, NM 87103 Phone: (505) 224-1468/Fax: (505) 346-7205

andrew.smith6@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Federal Defendants

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on January 20, 2011, I electronically transmitted the attached document to the Clerk's Office using the CM/ECF System for filing and transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following CM/ECF registrants:

THOMAS M. HNASKO
DULCINEA Z. HANUSCHAK
P.O. Box 2068
Santa Fe, NM 87504

Phone: (505) 982-4554/Fax: (505) 982-8623

thnasko@hinklelawfirm.com dhanuschak@hinklelawfirm.com

DIANE ALBERT 2108 Charlevoix St NW Albuquerque, NM 87104 Phone: (505) 842-1800 diane@dianealbertlaw.com

LINDSAY A. LOVEJOY, JR. Law Office of Lindsay A. Lovejoy, Jr. 3600 Cerrillos Road #1001A Santa Fe, NM 87507 Phone: (505) 983-1800/Fax: (505) 983-4508 lindsay@lindsaylovejoy.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff

/s/ John P. Tustin
JOHN P. TUSTIN
Attorney for Federal Defendants